

# FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

**Community Based Humanitarian Disaster Risk Reduction  
(CBHDRR)**

**District Shangla & Kohistan- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa**

**Aug-2018 till Dec-2020**



**For GERMAN RED CROSS**



TABLE OF CONTENTS	
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS/ACRONYMS</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>CHAPTER 01 INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>9</b>
<b>1.1 Background</b> .....	9
<b>1.2 Project Outcomes and Outputs</b> .....	10
1.3 Evaluation Purpose, Objectives and Scope .....	10
<b>CHAPTER 02 EVALUATION FINDINGS</b> .....	<b>12</b>
<i>Demographic Characteristics of Respondents</i> .....	12
OUTCOME 01 .....	16
Evaluation findings against outcome .....	18
Output 1: .....	23
Output 02 .....	37
Output 03 .....	47
Output 04: .....	52
Output 5: .....	60
Output 6: .....	65
Output 07 .....	67
<b>CHAPTER 03 EVALUATION RESPONSE TO DAC CRITERIA</b> .....	<b>68</b>
4.1 RELEVANCE .....	68
4.3 EFFICIENCY .....	71
4.4 IMPACT .....	72
4.5 SUSTAINABILITY .....	73
<b>CHAPTER 04 RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>73</b>
Limitations .....	75
Annex- A: Methodology .....	75
Annex -B: Tools .....	75
Annex .....	76

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS/ACRONYMS

ADO	Assistant District Officer
CBHDRR	Community Based Humanitarian Disaster Risk Reduction
CBHFA	Community-based Health and First Aid
CCA	Climate Change adaptation
CEA	Community Engagement and Accountability
DDMA	District Disaster Management Authority
DevCon	Development Consultants
DRM	Disaster Risk Management
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
FGDs	Focus group Discussion
GFFO	German Federal Foreign Office
GP	Global Project
GRC	German Red Cross
H&H	Health and Hygiene
HHs	Households
INGO	International Non-Government Organization
IP	Implementing Partner
IVCA	Integrated Vulnerability and Capacity Assessment
KII	Key Informant Interviews
KIIs	Key Informant Interviews
LFA	Logical Framework Analysis
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
MMP	Mirco Mitigation Project
PDMA	Provincial Disaster Management Authority
PRCS-NHQ	Pakistan Red Crescent Society-National Headquarters
PWDs	Persons with Disability
SPSS	Statistical Package for Social Sciences
TL	Team Leader
TORs	Terms of Reference
UC	Union Council
VCA	Vulnerability and Capacity Assessment
VO	Village Organisation

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

DevCon Development Consultants (Pvt.) Limited conducted the final evaluation of “Community Based Humanitarian Disaster Risk Reduction (CBHRR) District Shangla & Kohistan- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa” Project. DevCon team extends its appreciation to the Management and Project staff of PRCS for their continuous support and collaboration during the Study.

Special thanks to Mr Wasif Abbas and Mr Abdul Hadi Khattak for continuously facilitating the DevCon team about field activities and providing clarity when and where required. Team is also thankful to Mr Qaswar Abbas who provided us extensive details about the project that helped in the formation of this report.

The success of the study depended on the cooperation from project participants, government departments, and other stakeholders. DevCon extends its gratitude to everyone who participated in interviews, household and school surveys. Without their time, effort, information sharing, and discussions, this study would not have been possible

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The project “Community Based Humanitarian Disaster Risk Reduction (CBHDRR)” is implemented by Pakistan Red Crescent Society (PRCS) with the support of German Red Cross and financial assistance provided by German Federal Foreign Office (GFFO). The project was started in August 2018 and was completed in December 2020 in two districts (Shangla and Kohistan) of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) province of Pakistan. The selected Union Councils (UCs) included UC Ismail Khel of District Shangla (Village Council Machkandi with 04 Revenue Villages: namely Machkandi, Gomyar Upper, Dam, and Sheen Koprai) and UC Sazin of District Kohistan with three village Councils (VCs) namely VC Shatyal, Sumar Nala & Shuri Nala.

The key activities of the project included community awareness sessions on DRR, Climate Change Adaptation (CCA), Community-based Health and First Aid (CBHFA), Formation and strengthening of the community-based committees, capacity building sessions and training, simulation exercises, micro-mitigation projects (MMPs) at community and schools’ level, schools’ safety interventions in thirty-five (35) schools in both UCs, coordination and sustainability measures. Project also added Covid-19 support activities; distribution of food kits (Mansehra, Shangla, Swat and Malakand), hygiene kits (Kohat, Mansehra, Haripur, Abbottabad) and Cash Transfer in Peshawar of Khyberpakhtoon Khua province.

The purpose of the CBHDRR project evaluation was to critically assess the impact of the project interventions on the respective target population and achievement of the project towards key objectives/outcomes set forth in the project. The findings of the evaluation will help the donor, PRCS, GRC and Partner National Society (PNS) to reflect on the overall intended impact through assessing the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, and sustainability of the project.

Although initially for the quantitative part, the evaluation planned to reach 240 (120 male and 120 female community members in two project districts), but to enhance the coverage and capture better picture of the project impact, the evaluation reached out to **282** respondents in total out of which **130(46%) were female and 152(54%) were male**. Evaluation team conducted 22 FGDs and 08 key informant interviews with community groups, government, and project stakeholders. To evaluate the Covid-19 interventions implemented in other KP districts a sample of 10 respondents (05 male and 05 female) were taken from each of the 7 districts and the interviews were conducted on-phone with the randomly chosen beneficiaries<sup>1</sup> of the given locations.

## KEY FINDINGS

- The evaluation results confirmed the relevance of the project interventions to the actual needs of the target communities/groups. The Vulnerability and Capacity Assessment (VCA) carried out by the project in Shangla UC Ismail Khel (Machkandi) and Kohistan (UC Sazin) in March 2019 and April, 2019 was found to be an effective and useful activity that directly contributed in implementation of the project activities. The vulnerable groups of poor, women, children, widows, orphans and disable people of the community were selected and included in the project.
- The discussions held with the CO members and students confirmed that the needs of the vulnerable groups both at local and district level were duly considered during the development of the contingency/preparedness plans which make the project interventions relevant and thus address the needs of the respective communities.

---

<sup>1</sup> List of beneficiaries along with contact numbers was shared by GRC and DevCon team randomly chose 5 male and 5 females from that list.

## KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

- Participation of women in the Community Committees was a great achievement of the project; however, women role can be improved further by ensuring their active involvement in management and governance level so they can be more involved in planning and decision-making process. Project in future can organize leadership trainings/sessions with women members to enhance their management skills to play an active role in the COs.
- Community Committees should also be capacitated on Participatory M&E methods and tools so that they can ensure quality, functionality, and sustainability of hard and soft interventions during the implementation and after the project closure.
- Project has actively involved the marginalized people in the project activities, but for future the project should design and plan specific activities and interventions for the community on vocational and skills development courses so they can restore their self- esteem and can contribute more effectively to the economic development process.
- Community notice Boards and distributed IEC material could be made more effective through pictorial presentations as majority of the community members are not literate. Therefore, IEC material with pictorial illustrations can be used for the awareness raising purpose in illiterate community.
- The linkages with the Government departments at the District and provincial level can be further strengthened by exploring the common working areas or themes with the Government and find areas where PRCS/GRC can coordinate with the Government in technical or non-technical support. For instance, if PRCS can contribute to the District contingency planning particularly to school safety. This can help in improving recognition of PRCS and build their goodwill, which will ultimately help in further improving and strengthening these linkages.
- Secondary information sources states that CEA mechanism was established in the last quarter of project although COVID-19 pandemic was one of the major causes of significant delay, but it should have been developed at the very start of the project to familiarize the community of the basic project's activities and the feedback mechanism.
- Project should have the exit strategy designed from the start of the project. The community and the other involved stakeholders should also be involved in the development of the project exit strategy so the clarity and agreement about the role and responsibilities of the stakeholders can be defined and agreed at the inception phase of the project. This contributes in a very systematic manner and helps in improving the coordination with and among the stakeholders during the implementation of project and to take ownership of the project after its closure.
- Project team at the National/Head office levels and at the field level should be more oriented in detail about the project log frame and the results from the very start. PRCS and GRC should also explore the innovative ways of documenting and presenting the success of the projects for showcasing funding and programme development purposes.